



End Notes

Chapter 1: An Italian in Kashmir

1. The argument that Partition violence was organised and purposeful rather than spontaneous acts of vengeance is made forcefully in Paul R. Brass, *Forms of Collective Violence: Riots, Pogroms, and Genocide in Modern India*, Gurgaon, 2006.

2. Letter, Bidy Dykes to Muriel Gambs, 17 October [1947], made available to me by Bidy's eldest son, the late Tom Dykes junior.

3. Pamela Barretto, *Looking Back after 50 Years*, privately printed in Australia, 1997, 18pp.

4. *History of Operations in Jammu and Kashmir, 1947–48*, Indian Defence Ministry, Delhi, 1987, pp. 388–90, republishes the operational instruction for the start of the airlift.

5. *Daily Express*, 10 and 11 November 1947.

6. *Daily Express*, 10 November 1947.

7. Entry in Father George Shanks's diary on pages for 13–14 April .

Chapter 2: Caught in the Middle

1. The discrepancy between the frequent portrayal of kashmiriyat as eliding over the differences between Kashmiri Muslims and Hindus, and the quite different reality, is discussed in two pioneering academic studies, Chitrakha Zutshi, *Languages of Belonging: Islam, regional identity, and the making of Kashmir*, Delhi, 2003, and Mridu Rai, *Hindu Rulers, Muslim Subjects: Islam, rights, and the history of Kashmir*, Delhi, 2004.

2. Asiya Andrabi, leader of the separatist Kashmiri women's group Dukhtaran-e-Millat, has declared: 'I don't believe in Kashmiriyat. I don't believe in nationalism. I believe there are just two nations—Muslims and non-Muslims.' *Outlook*, Delhi, 14 August 2006.

3. Alexander Evans, 'A departure from history: Kashmiri Pandits, 1990–2001', *Contemporary South Asia*, 2002, pp. 19–37.

4. Michael Brecher, *The Struggle for Kashmir*, New York, 1953, p. 4.
5. Mohammad Ishaq Khan, *History of Srinagar, 1846–1947: A Study in Socio-cultural Change*, Srinagar, 2007, pp. 34–37.
6. The Kashmir Study Group based in New York published in 2005 a revised edition of its prospectus for Kashmir's future, *Kashmir: A Way Forward*. This used official census data to estimate the population of the various parts of the former princely state as of 2001. Of the Indian-controlled areas, it put the population of the Kashmir Valley at 5.4 million, of Jammu at 4.4 million and of Ladakh at 0.2 million. Of Pakistan's portion of Kashmir, it estimated the population of Azad Kashmir at 3.2 million and of the Northern Areas at 0.9 million. That's a total of 14.2 million, as against 4.02 million in the last pre-independence census in 1941.
7. Niaz Naik interviewed in Islamabad, 24 January 2000. Although these substantive discussions on Kashmir got nowhere, the channel of communication established proved of value in helping to resolve the Kargil conflict of 1999.
8. Typescript memoirs of Sir James Acheson, f. 52. Acheson was the British Resident in Kashmir, 1943–45. I am grateful to his grandson, Nigel Acheson, for sending me extracts from these unpublished memoirs, which are held in the India Office Records at the British Library.
9. The development of the press in Kashmir is discussed in Khan, *History of Srinagar*, pp. 193–205.
10. Zutshi, *Languages of Belonging*, pp. 302–08. Kashmiri politics in the 1940s is also discussed in Ian Copland, 'The Abdullah Factor: Kashmiri Muslims and the crisis of 1947', in D.A. Low (ed.), *The Political Inheritance of Pakistan*, London, 1991.
11. A brief account of the 'Mr A' case can be found in Ian Copland, *The Princes of India in the Endgame of Empire, 1917–1947*, Cambridge, 1997, p. 60.
12. *Hindustan Times*, 14 October 1947. A week later, Kashmir's Prime Minister, M.C. Mahajan, was still talking about Kashmir's goal of being 'the Switzerland of the Eastern Hemisphere'—*Times of India*, 21 October 1947.
13. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.213–19, India Office Records, British Library. The conversation took place in Lahore on 1 November 1947.
14. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.566–68. Scott added that Kashmiris 'realise that a hostile Pakistan could seriously disrupt Kashmir's economy'.
15. Sumantra Bose, *Kashmir: Roots of Conflict, Paths to Peace*, Harvard, 2003, pp. 59–60. In 1997, Sheikh Abdullah's son, Farooq Abdullah—then chief minister of the Indian state of Jammu and Kashmir—told me his father had aspired to Kashmir being 'a kind of Switzerland'. He added that whatever the views his father had once held, an independent Kashmir 'was simply not possible any more . . . [and] would lead to massacres the like of which we did not see even in 47'.
16. Muhammad Yusuf Saraf, *Kashmiris Fight for Freedom*, Vol. 1, Lahore, 1977, pp. 617–38, provides a detailed and highly personal account of Jinnah's visit to the Kashmir Valley.

17. Ian Copland, 'The Abdullah Factor', pp. 222–23. The 'ripe fruit' quote appears in Chaudhri Muhammad Ali, *The Emergence of Pakistan*, London, 1967, p. 297—the author was the first secretary-general of the Pakistan government. There is a brief discussion of the contrasting attitudes of Congress and the Muslim League to the princely states, and the reasons why Jinnah was more willing to contemplate their independence, in Hasan Zaheer, *The Times and Trial of the Rawalpindi Conspiracy 1951: The First Coup Attempt in Pakistan*, Karachi, 1998, pp. 54–5.

18. *Hindustan Times*, 28 October 1947.

19. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation, 1947–48*, New Delhi, 1994, pp. 2–3. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir (1947–48)*, Indian Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, 1987, p. 31.

20. *Statesman*, 28 November 1947.

21. Prem Shankar Jha, *The Origins of a Dispute: Kashmir 1947*, New Delhi, 2003, discusses this issue at length. Jha also publishes as an appendix the remarkable written testimony of Christopher Beaumont, private secretary to the chairman of the Boundary Commission, who severely chastises both his boss, Sir Cyril Radcliffe, and Lord Mountbatten for the circumstances in which Ferozepur in Punjab was allocated to India. Beaumont insists, however, that there was no last minute reallocation in regard to Gurdaspur. Alastair Lamb—*Incomplete Partition: The Genesis of the Kashmir Dispute, 1947–1948*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, pp. 84–92—argues that the Gurdaspur award was influenced by Sikh sensitivities and not by the Kashmir issue.

22. Stanley Wolpert, *Nehru: A Tryst with Destiny*, Oxford, 1996, pp. 165, 272. Philip Ziegler, *Mountbatten: The Official Biography*, London, 1985, p. 445.

23. Brecher, *Struggle for Kashmir*, p. 54.

24. *The Times*, 6 October 1947. Gyanendra Pandey, *Remembering Partition: Violence, Nationalism and History in India*, Cambridge, 2001, p. 36—the figures are based on the reckoning of a British diplomat.

25. *New York Times*, 18 September 1948. The correspondent was Robert Trumbull.

26. *Statesman*, 22 October 1947. *Dawn*, 22 October 1947. Sheikh Abdullah had written to the maharaja days prior to his release to 'assure Your Highness the fullest and loyal support of myself and my organization'—Karan Singh, *Heir Apparent: An Autobiography*, New Delhi, 1982, pp. 81–82.

27. *Dawn*, 15 and 19 October 1947.

28. Zaheer, *Rawalpindi Conspiracy*, p. 87. Margaret Parton, *The Leaf and the Flame*, New York, 1959, pp. 128–31.

29. *The Times*, 10 October 1947.

30. Copland, 'The Abdullah Factor', p. 245. That assertion is supported by Michael Brecher's interviews in the summer of 1951 with about 200 people in the Valley, which led him to conclude that 'the Kashmiris are essentially pro-Kashmir, not pro-India or pro-Pakistan,' but that a clear majority preferred Indian rule to the prospect of accession to Pakistan—Brecher, p. 168.

31. *Hindustan Times*, 20 October 1947. Ajit Bhattacharjea, *Kashmir: The Wounded Valley*, New Delhi, 1994, pp. 127–28.

Chapter 3: ‘Wild Bearded Beasts’

1. Abdullah Muntazer interviewed in Islamabad, 25 January 2000. Although the fighting in Kashmir started in autumn 1947, the initial India–Pakistan war is generally dated as 1948, because Pakistani troops were only formally deployed from the spring of 1948. Tribal forces took the lead in the incursion into the Kashmir Valley in October–November 1947, and were also involved in the fighting in 1948. In May 2006, Abdullah Muntazer was working in Lahore as the editor of the English website of Jamaat-ud-Dawa, widely regarded as a front organisation for Lashkar-e-Toiba.

2. Sardar M. Ibrahim Khan, *The Kashmir Saga*, Mirpur, 1990, p. 15.

3. Olaf Caroe, *The Pathans, 550 BC–AD 1957*, Karachi 1983, p. 256.

4. See James W. Spain, *The Pathan Borderland*, The Hague, 1963, p. 210, and the same author’s *Pathans of the Latter Day*, Karachi, 1995, p. 115.

5. Recounted in Mukulika Banerjee, *The Pathan Unarmed: Opposition and Memory in the North West Frontier*, Oxford, 2000. The movement’s leader Khan Abdul Gaffar Khan was a political ally of Sheikh Abdullah. Khan and Nehru famously visited Kashmir together in 1940.

6. Spain, *The Pathan Borderland*, p. 204, recounts how the Pakistan government decided, almost immediately on independence, to abandon all army installations in the tribal belt, completing the pull-out by the close of 1947.

7. Linda Colley, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World, 1600–1850*, London, 2003, p. 361.

8. *Daily Express*, London, 10 and 11 November 1947. Robert Trumbull, *As I See India*, New York, 1956, pp. 84–89. Margaret Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom*, New York, 1949, p. 203. C.E. Tyndale-Biscoe, *Tyndale-Biscoe of Kashmir: An Autobiography*, London, 1951, p. 271.

9. Akbar S. Ahmed, ‘Tribes and States in Central and South Asia’, *Asian Affairs*, 1980, p. 157. Alan Warren, *Waziristan, the Faqir of Ipi and the Indian Army: The North West Frontier Revolt of 1936–37*, Oxford, 2000, p. xxv.

10. Ahmed, p. 155. Ahmed suggests that lashkars from more settled Pathan areas, particularly those with irrigated land, were more disciplined, and so more effective in keeping and controlling territory.

11. Warren, pp. 279–80.

12. Alastair Lamb, *Incomplete Partition: The Genesis of the Kashmir Dispute, 1947–1948*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, p. 121.

13. ‘The Revolt in Poonch’ written by Richard Symonds on 8 December 1947. DO142/494, British National Archives.

14. ‘Let it be Maharajah’s rule. It is a lesser evil, if you would like to call

it. It is better than the whole region being on fire’—Sardar Abdul Qayum Khan’s interview in the *Times of India*, 27 September 2005.

15. Ibrahim Khan, pp. 71–76.

16. Ibrahim Khan, pp. 99–100.

17. The Fakir of Ipi, Mirza Ali Khan, later advocated ‘Pakhtoonistan’, a nation state uniting Pathans. He remained a nuisance to the Pakistan authorities, encouraging revolt from his headquarters in a cluster of mountain caves near the Afghan border, until his death in 1960.

18. *Statesman*, 18 October 1947.

19. *New York Herald Tribune*, 25 October 1947.

20. Spain, *Pathan Borderland*, pp. 195, 201. Erland Jansson, *India, Pakistan or Pakhtunistan? The Nationalist Movement in the North-West Frontier Province, 1937–47*, Uppsala, 1981, pp. 121, 165–66. A Pakistani website, www.cybercity-online.net/seanic21.net/pof, asserts that Pir Aminul Hasanat, who became known as ‘Pir Sahib of Manki Sharif’, was born at Manki Sharif in 1923 and joined the Muslim League in 1945. He gave up active politics in 1955, and died in a road accident in 1960.

21. Personal communication from Andy Roth. There is a brief biographical note about Akbar Khan in Hasan Zaheer, *The Times and Trial of the Rawalpindi Conspiracy 1951: The First Coup Attempt in Pakistan*, Karachi, 1998, pp. xxx–xxxii.

22. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, Delhi, pp. 8–20.

23. Tariq Ali, *The Clash of Fundamentalisms: Crusades, Jihads and Modernity*, London, 2002, pp. 234–35.

24. Sirdar Shaukat Hyat Khan recounted in his memoirs *The Nation That Lost Its Soul: Memoirs of a Freedom Fighter*, Lahore, 1995, p. 214, that he reluctantly gave Khurshid Anwar military command of the operation on the urging of Pakistan’s finance minister, Ghulam Mohammed, who was related to Anwar. Akbar Khan recalled, p. 17, that Khurshid Anwar emerged out of the meeting convened by the prime minister and confided ‘that he was not going to accept any orders from Shaukat Hyat Khan’.

25. Shaukat Hyat Khan, p. 215. Hasan Zaheer, p. 85.

26. Shaukat Hyat Khan, p. 215.

27. The Hazara district, which includes Abbottabad, is the eastern-most part of the North West Frontier Province, bordering Kashmir. It is mainly Hindko and Pashto speaking. The Black Mountain is a mountain range in this area.

28. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.566–68, India Office Records, British Library. *New York Times*, 31 October 1947. Trumbull said the conversation had taken place three weeks earlier, making Jinnah the likely source for his report—published on 9 October—that Pakistan’s leaders privately but strongly believed that a long-standing Sikh plan lay behind the communal violence which marred Partition, with the intention ‘to strangle this baby at birth’.

29. Diary of Sir George Cunningham, 1947–8, MSS Eur.D 670/6, India

Office Records, British Library. General Sir Douglas Gracey was Pakistan's acting commander-in-chief.

30. *Statesman*, 25 October 1947, 1 November 1947. *Times of India*, 23 October 1947.

31. A.R. Siddiqi, 'Ex-Major General Mohd Akbar Khan, DSO, Talks on Pakistan's First War and First Coup', *Defence Journal*, Karachi, 1985, pp. 1–28. Brigadier Siddiqi himself, the editor of the *Defence Journal*, had no doubt about the role of the chief minister, asserting in an article serving as the introduction to his interview with Akbar Khan: 'Beginning as a tribal foray with the backing of a provincial minister (Khan Abdul Qayyum Khan) and the connivance of the central government under the overall command of one retired Major Khurshid Anwar . . . fighting in Kashmir subsequently developed into an irregular campaign officered by the Pakistani regulars and manned mainly by the tribals and partly by army jawans [soldiers].'

32. DO142/494, British National Archives. The diplomatic memo in question appears to have been written early in December 1947.

33. Jansson, pp. 196–97. For a sour view of Khurshid Anwar from a political rival, see Wali Khan, *Facts Are Facts: The Untold Story of India's Partition*, New Delhi, 1987, pp. 122, 155, and also Banerjee, *Pathan Unarmed*, p. 186.

34. Frank Leeson, *Frontier Legion: With the Khassadars of North Waziristan*, Ferring, 2003, p. 205.

35. Frank Leeson interviewed in Worthing, 20 June 2001.

36. C.B. Duke's report is dated 23 October 1947—DO142/494. British diplomats believed that the Kashmir state forces has been responsible, prior to the invasion, for the 'systematic devastation and expulsion of Muslims along a three mile wide belt on the Pakistan border', LP&S/13/1845c—presumably to create a buffer and to make it easier to detect any infiltration of fighters or military equipment.

37. Owen Bennett Jones, *Pakistan: Eye of the Storm*, Yale, 2002, p. 63.

38. *Observer*, 2 November 1947.

39. O.S. Kalkat, *The Far-Flung Frontiers*, New Delhi, 1983, pp. 29–42.

40. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir (1947–48)*, Indian Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, 1987, p. 18. S.L. Menezes, *Fidelity and Honour: The Indian Army from the 17th Century to the 21st Century*, Delhi, 1999, p. 439. On the other hand, some in the Pakistan army complained loudly that British officers 'were not in sympathy with Pakistan's claim over Kashmir', Zaheer, pp. xvi–xvii.

41. The article in *Dawn*, which was datelined Karachi, 7 December 1947, is contained in the *Government of India White Paper on Jammu & Kashmir*, New Delhi, 1948, pp. 4–5.

42. LP&S/13/1850, ff. 32–35.

43. Krishna Mehta, *Chaos in Kashmir*, Kolkata, 1954, pp. 15–16.

44. A.R. Siddiqi, p. 18.

45. C.B. Duke's report was dated 28–29 October 1947. DO142/494.



46. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation, 1947–48*, New Delhi, 1994, pp. 37–39. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, p. 36. For a more detailed Indian account of the initial military exchanges, see the Indian Defence Ministry's *History of Operations in Jammu and Kashmir (1947–48)*, pp. 16–24. Khurshid Anwar, in his interview with *Dawn*, said he clashed in Uri with Patiala Sikh soldiers. While the Sikh-ruled princely state of Patiala had sent a small number of troops to Kashmir, there's no firm evidence that they were deployed in forward positions.

47. *Daily Express*, 27 October 1947.

Chapter 4: The Mission

1. William (George) Shanks, 1909–62. Gerard Mallett, 1913–70. Details of the circumstances of their deaths are taken from their personal files in the Central Archive, Mill Hill.

2. The items Mrs Corboy sent me are being deposited at the Mill Hill archive. Father Hormise Nirmal Raj, in 'Unknown Churches, Unknown Martyrs', a typescript study of the church in Kashmir, a copy of which is held in the Mill Hill archive, asserted that Shanks 'had completely broken down mentally since the raid of 1947 [and] was still ill even after becoming the Prefect Apostolic'.

3. Letter, Father George Shanks to Veronica Shanks, 20 September 1947.

4. Quoted by Father Hormise Nirmal Raj, f. 96. This source, f. 99, records just how modest was the number of new conversions: 'One may say nil in Kashmir, and few in Jammu.'

5. I am grateful to Sister Sheila O'Neill, who has been researching the history of the Franciscan Missionaries of Mary, for providing this extract from the order's records, and much other valuable assistance.

6. Report by Father Shanks, undated typescript 9 ff., Mill Hill archive.

7. The Mill Hill missionaries have since moved from St Joseph's College at Mill Hill, and their archive is being relocated to Freshfield in Merseyside.

8. Father Shanks's diary entry on pages for 9–12 February.

9. Shanks's diary entry on pages for 26–29 January.

10. Shanks diary entry on pages for 22–25 January.

11. Muhammad Yusuf Saraf, *Kashmiris Fight for Freedom*, Vol. 2, Lahore, 1979, pp. 903–04.

12. LP&S/13/1850, ff. 38, 111–12, India Office Records, British Library.

13. Shanks diary entry on pages for 1–4 April.

14. Shanks's typescript report, f. 2.

15. James W. Spain, *The Way of the Pathans*, London, 1962, pp. 16–17. Ian Stephens, *Horned Moon: An Account of a Journey through Pakistan, Kashmir and Afghanistan*, London, 1954, pp. 217–18, tells the story of an ornate Kashmiri dagger hilt taken back to Waziristan by a veteran of the raid. Another writer about the Pathans heard accounts of 'numerous items which were clearly

of Kashmiri origin in the houses of Waziri maliks'—Victoria Schofield, *Every Rock, Every Hill: The Plain Tale of the North-West Frontier and Afghanistan*, London, 1984, p. 251.

Chapter 5: The Attack

1. Colonel Dykes's Record of Services, much akin to a log book of army courses and promotions, was obtained from the India Office Records at the British Library with the consent and cooperation of his two elder sons.

2. I am grateful to Alison Spurway, whose mother was a friend of Bidy Dykes in India in the early 1940s, for sending me photographs of Bidy and her family.

3. Mother Teresalina's civil name was Joaquina Zubiri Sanchez. She was born in the Spanish Basque country.

4. From the account of a survivor set down in writing in 2002. This eyewitness later settled in Karachi and asked not to be named. Spellings and punctuation have been amended.

5. 'Autres Détails Concernant le 27–10–47 Donnés Par Soeur M. Priscilla', undated typescript, f.1. I am grateful to Father Jim Borst for making available to me copies of this and other documents in his care in Srinagar. My thanks also to Nathalie Monnot for improving my translation from the French.

6. Shanks diary entry on pages for 9–12 April, Mill Hill archive. In this account, Shanks gave Hyat Khan the fictional name of Major Yakoob Khan.

7. Shanks diary entry on pages for 3–6 May. I was told that the nun with the gold tooth was Sister Petra, a Spanish nun latterly living at a convent in south India but unwilling to be interviewed about the attack.

8. LP&S/13/1850, f.119, India Office Records, British Library.

9. Shanks diary entry on pages for 15–20 May.

10. Sardar Sherbaz Khan Mazari interviewed by telephone to Karachi, 12 May 2003. The incident is also recounted in Sherbaz Khan Mazari, *A Journey to Disillusionment*, Karachi, 1999, pp. 11–12. Mazari believed that his trip to Kashmir was made in the spring of 1948—but if indeed, as he recalled, he reached as far as the vicinity of Baramulla, his journey must have been in late October or early November 1947.

11. George Shanks to Very Rev. T. McLaughlin, 14 November 1947, Mill Hill archive.

12. 'The Sacking of BARAMULLA (Kashmir) by the Tribesmen of PAKISTAN', undated typescript, 3 ff., apparently written by Father Severin de Jong, Mill Hill archive.

13. Larry Collins and Dominique Lapierre, *Freedom at Midnight*, Delhi, 1995, p. 357.

14. S.L. Menezes, *Fidelity and Honour: The Indian Army from the 17th Century to the 21st Century*, Delhi, 1999, p. 438. Lt Gen. Stanley Menezes interviewed in London, 12 May 2003.

15. Brian Cloughley, *A History of the Pakistan Army: Wars and Insurrections*, Oxford, 2000, p. 14.

Chapter 6: Signing up to India

1. Karan Singh interviewed in New Delhi, 2 May 1997. For an account of the gossip surrounding his birth, see Tariq Ali, *The Clash of Fundamentalisms: Crusades, Jihads and Modernity*, London, 2002, pp. 225–26.

2. Karan Singh, *Heir Apparent: An Autobiography*, New Delhi, 1982, p. 145.

3. Mehr Chand Mahajan, *Looking Back*, Mumbai, 1963, p. 266.

4. Sir George Cunningham's diary, 18 October 1947, MSS Eur.D 670/6, India Office Records, British Library.

5. Karan Singh, *Heir Apparent*, p. 40.

6. The instrument of accession prepared for princely rulers ceded to India only authority over defence, external affairs and communications. It stated: 'Nothing in this Instrument affects the continuance of my sovereignty in and over this State.' However, in practice the situation was much more fluid. 'Gradually the realization dawned on [the rulers] that after the advent of independence they would have no choice but to grant responsible government to their people Fears regarding the likely attitude of popular ministries were not entirely groundless. Take the case of Kashmir: no sooner had Sheikh Abdullah secured complete power than he insisted that the Maharajah should stay out of the State. It was on Sardar [Patel]'s persuasion that the Maharajah agreed to do so, though reluctantly.' V.P. Menon, *Integration of the Indian States*, Hyderabad, 1985, pp. 485–86.

7. Alan Campbell-Johnson, *Mission with Mountbatten*, London, 1951, p. 120. Menon, p. 394.

8. Sir Frank Messervy, 'Kashmir', *Asiatic Review*, January 1949, pp. 469–82. Campbell-Johnson, p. 48.

9. Mahajan, p. 126. See also Prem Shankar Jha, *The Origins of a Dispute: Kashmir 1947*, New Delhi, 2003, pp. 47–49. Nehru's own thoughts are reflected in his letter to Sardar Patel of 27 September 1947—*Selected Works of Jawaharlal Nehru*, Second Series, Vol. 4, New Delhi, 1986, pp. 263–65.

10. Margaret Parton papers, Division of Special Collections, University of Oregon. I am grateful to the University of Oregon Libraries for permission to quote from these papers.

11. Christopher Snedden, 'What Happened to Muslims in Jammu? Local Identity, "the Massacre" of 1947 and the Roots of the "Kashmir Problem"', *South Asia*, 2001, 24/2, pp. 111–34.

12. Mahajan, p. 150.

13. The e-mail was sent to Owen Bennett Jones, a BBC presenter and author of a history of Pakistan, by R.L. Batra's great-grandson, Sudeep Budhiraja. I am grateful to Mr Budhiraja for his help in establishing the provenance of the

maharaja's letter. His copy of this document is not the original, but a photocopy, with filing holes punched in the side. Dr Karan Singh is not convinced of its authenticity. In response to my query, he e-mailed to say: 'I have not before come across the attached document. Prima facie it seems highly unlikely that my father would have deputed a comparatively minor functionary for such an important task.' Those historians who have researched in the maharaja's archives and to whom I have shown this document share my view that it is likely to be genuine. The letter appears to be the 'intriguing document', hitherto undiscovered, about which Alastair Lamb speculates in his book *Incomplete Partition: The Genesis of the Kashmir Dispute, 1947–1948*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, pp. 143–48.

14. For the drama about Hyderabad's volte face over accession in late October 1947, see H.V. Hodson, *The Great Divide: Britain–India–Pakistan*, London, 1969, pp. 478–82.

15. The text of Nehru's broadcast is given in the *Government of India White Paper on Jammu & Kashmir*, New Delhi, 1948, pp. 52–55.

16. Campbell-Johnson, p. 225. Campbell-Johnson was out of India at the time of the defence committee meetings of 25 and 26 October, and was briefed on what happened by Mountbatten on 28 October. It's likely that this account conflates Mountbatten's contributions to the two meetings. The minutes of both defence committee meetings are reprinted in Jha, pp. 197–213.

17. Karan Singh interviewed in Delhi, 2 May 1997. There's also an account in his autobiography, *Heir Apparent*, pp. 57–58.

18. Menon, p. 398.

19. Sam Manekshaw ended his military career as a field marshal. His statement about the mission to Srinagar was recorded by Prem Shankar Jha in December 1994 and appears as an appendix in Jha's book.

20. Karan Singh, pp. 58–59. Victor Rosenthal was a Russian who, in the words of Karan Singh, 'had enjoyed a fabulously chequered and romantic career'. He was one of the maharaja's closest friends and advisers.

21. Mahajan, pp. 151–52, 277. This curious account of a crucial conversation is borne out by Sheikh Abdullah's autobiography, *Flames of the Chinar*, New Delhi, 1993, p. 95. Sheikh Abdullah had apparently flown to Delhi on 25 October, his second visit to the Indian capital since being released from jail the previous month.

22. *White Paper*, p. 3.

23. Menon, pp. 399–400.

24. The most detailed recent accounts of the accession drama are to be found in Lamb, pp. 139–78, Jha, pp. 64–85, and Victoria Schofield, *Kashmir in Conflict: India, Pakistan and the Unfinished War*, London, 2000, pp. 49–72.

25. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.283–95, India Office Records. Symon recorded this in a summary of developments in Kashmir, written in diary form and compiled on 27 October.

26. Mahajan, pp. 152–53. Mahajan regarded the letter carried to Delhi on 24 October by his deputy R.L. Batra as the 'letter of accession', so explaining his reference to 'supplementary documents'.

27. Mahajan, p. 154. In an appendix to his autobiography, Mahajan suggested in passing that the instrument of accession was signed by the maharaja before he left Srinagar, a comment not repeated in his more detailed account of the events surrounding accession. The plane which took Mahajan and Menon to Jammu appears to have flown on to Srinagar with Sheikh Abdullah and a British officer on diplomatic duty, Major W.P. Cranston. LP&S/13/1850, ff.32–35, India Office Records.

28. Jha, pp. 186–91.

29. *Sardar Patel's Correspondence 1945–50: Vol. 1, New Light on Kashmir*, Ahmedabad, 1971. The instrument of accession is in the holdings of India's National Archive. I have been refused permission to consult the document because it is, apparently, classified. A facsimile of the entire document was posted in 2005 at the Indian ministry of home affairs website.

30. *Selected Works of Jawaharlal Nehru*, 2: 4, pp. 278–99.

31. This is also the conclusion of Stanley Wolpert, the biographer of both Jinnah and Nehru—see his *Nehru: A Tryst with Destiny*, Oxford, 1996, pp. 416–17.

32. Jha, p. 212.

33. A copy of the statement, dated 31 October 1947, is in the India Office Records, LP&S/13/1845b, f. 220.

34. LP&S/13/1845b, f.471, India Office Records.

35. The operational instruction is reprinted in the Indian defence ministry's *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir (1947–48)*, New Delhi, 1987, pp. 388–90.

36. S.K. Sinha, *Operation Rescue: Military Operations in Jammu & Kashmir, 1947–49*, New Delhi, 1977, p. 14–16.

37. Cited in Maurice Cohen, *Thunder over Kashmir*, Kolkata, 1955, p. 3.

38. Hiralal Atal, *Nehru's Emissary to Kashmir*, New Delhi, 1972, p. 34–36. Bharat Kumar, *An Incredible War: Indian Air Force in Kashmir War 1947–48*, New Delhi, 2007, p. 47.

39. DO142/494, British National Archives. The high commissioner's memo was dated 1 November 1947.

40. Nehru to Hiralal Atal, 27 October 1947, *Selected Works*, 2:4, pp. 283–86.

41. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.469–70, India Office Records.

42. Mountbatten to Patel, 27 October 1947, *Sardar Patel's Correspondence*, 1, pp. 68–69. Nehru to Sheikh Abdullah, 27 October 1947, *Selected Works*, 2:4, pp. 279–82.

Chapter 7: Liberating Kashmir

1. Inayatullah (not his full name, which he asked to be withheld) interviewed in Baramulla, 8 March 1997.

2. Muhammad Yusuf Saraf, *Kashmiris Fight for Freedom*, Vol. 2, Lahore, 1979, p. 906.

3. Saraf, Vol. 2, p. 908.
4. Statement of Mother Mary of St Conwall (a Scottish woman, Barbara McPhilimy), LP&S/13/1850, f.119, India Office Records, British Library. 'Autres Détails Concernant le 27–10–47 Donnés Par Soeur M. Priscilla', undated typescript, f.3, courtesy of Father Jim Borst in Srinagar.
5. LP&S/13/1850, ff.256–57, India Office Records. This telegram from Delhi to London was apparently written on 26 October 1947.
6. *List of Non-Muslim Abducted Women and Children in Pakistan and Pakistan Side of the Cease-Fire Line in Jammu & Kashmir State*, [New Delhi, 1954]. I am indebted to Urvashi Butalia for allowing me to consult her copy of this remarkable and moving book. It is also discussed in Urvashi Butalia, *The Other Side of Silence: Voices from the Partition of India*, New Delhi, 1998, pp. 134–48. She comments: 'One of the myths that historians of communal conflict have held clear, and that victims of such conflict often help to perpetrate, is that the aggressors are always "outsiders". This list, to me, was conclusive proof of the opposite: so many women had been picked up by men of the same village.'
7. Ranjit Kaur, 'Back Again, After 40 Years', in Ritu Menon (ed.), *No Woman's Land: Women from Pakistan, India & Bangladesh Write on the Partition of India*, New Delhi, 2004, pp. 147–53.
8. Krishna Mehta, *Crisis in Kashmir*, Kolkata, 1954, republished most recently as *Kashmir 1947: A Survivor's Story*, New Delhi, 2005.
9. Margaret Brown, *Cross Every Mountain: The Story of Lily Boal, Missionary to Kashmir, India & Pakistan*, Newtownabbey, 1992, p. 67. For a passing reference to a Kashmiri Sikh boy orphaned in 1947–48 who converted to Islam, see J.H. Harvey-Kelly, 'Kashmir—1948', *Hagha Dagha*, August 1993.
10. Kamla Patel, *Torn from the Roots: A Partition Memoir*, New Delhi, 2006, pp. 171–76. See also Parvez Dewan, *Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh: Jammu*, New Delhi, 2007, pp. 154–57.
11. Robert Trumbull, *As I See India*, New York, 1956, p. 89. A cruder version of the same argument was put forward by an Indian army veteran of the conflict: 'Had the tribesmen not delayed at the Baramulla convent for a little recreational rape, the Kashmir war might have been fought differently'—E.A. Vas, *Without Baggage: A Personal Account of the Jammu and Kashmir Operations, October 1947–January 1949*, Dehra Dun, n.d., p. 11.
12. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, Delhi, n.d., pp. 37–38.
13. *The Times*, 10 November 1947. The estimate of 10,000 fighters in the lashkar was one repeated by the *Observer*, the *New York Times* and the *Hindustan Times*.
14. *Times of India*, 6 November 1947.
15. 'Note on Visit to Abbottabad', 3 ff., DO 142/494, British National Archives. This is a fascinating and detailed account apparently written by C.B. Duke, a British diplomat based in Lahore.
16. Smith's testimony is recorded in DO142/194, as told to British diplomats in Delhi on 11 November 1947.

17. Saraf, Vol. 2, p. 908.
18. *Times of India*, 11 November 1947—a slightly different account appeared in the *Hindustan Times*, 12 November 1947.
19. ‘The Burning of Baramulla’ by Frank Moraes, *Times of India*, 13 April 1957. Father Shanks’s manuscript account of the raid suggests that the Pir of Manki Sharif came to the mission on 29 October.
20. Sir George Cunningham’s diary for 29 October 1947, MSS Eur.D.670/6, India Office Records. Much of this entry is also cited in Norval Mitchell, *Sir George Cunningham: A Memoir*, Edinburgh, 1968, pp. 143–45.
21. An authoritative and sympathetic history of the Pakistan army—Brian Cloughley, *A History of the Pakistan Army: Wars and Insurrections*, Oxford, 2000, pp. 18–19—concluded: ‘Certainly, the invasion was conducted by tribesmen, but as time went on they were joined and indeed directed by Pakistani officers in civilian guise although referred to by military rank.’
22. When British diplomats enquired about Sydney Smith’s account of this large contingent of Punjabis, the Pakistani military authorities suggested that these men were in fact Poonchis, Muslim ex-soldiers from the Poonch area of the princely state. Like Punjabis, Poonchis would have been quite distinct in appearance from both Kashmiris and Pathans.
23. Personal communication from Jim Michaels.
24. Sardar Patel, India’s deputy prime minister, was regarded by the Pakistani leadership as a hawk.
25. LP&S/13/1845b, ff.213–9, India Office Records.
26. The article in *Dawn* was datelined Karachi, 7 December 1947 and was included in India’s *White Paper* of 1948.
27. Frank Leeson, *Frontier Legion: With the Khassadars of North Waziristan*, Ferring, 2003, p. 211.
28. Qayum Khan’s remarks about military training for the Frontier tribes were reported in the *Hindustan Times*, 22 November 1947.

Chapter 8: Heading for Srinagar

1. There are several Indian military memoirs of 1947–48, and some disagreement between them. The most detailed published narrative of the first few days of the Sikh regiment’s deployment in Kashmir, in Amarinder Singh, *Lest We Forget*, Patiala, 2000, pp. 19–68, has made use of otherwise unavailable Indian military records. Other Indian accounts with a claim to authority are Kuldip Singh Bajwa, *Jammu and Kashmir War (1947–48): Political and Military Perspective*, New Delhi, 2003, Bharat Kumar, *An Incredible War: Indian Air Force in Kashmir War 1947–48*, New Delhi, 2007; and *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir (1947–48)*, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, 1987. A detailed Pakistani account of the fighting is given in *History of the Azad Kashmir Regiment, Vol. 1, 1947–1949*, Mansar, 1997.

2. DO142/494, British National Archives. The despatch from Lahore was written on 31 October 1947. In the margin in pencil next to the reference to the presence of a British officer in Kashmir is the word 'Untrue'.

3. Cranston's note of 27 November 1947 is in the India Office Records at the British Library, LP&S/13/1850,f.38. Cranston had also made an earlier trip to Srinagar in mid-October 1947.

4. DO 142/494. The official Indian account suggests nine Indian fatalities in these initial exchanges—Amarinder Singh, p. 42.

5. Agha Humayun Amin, 'The war of lost opportunities: Part 1', from the online edition of the *Defence Journal*, Karachi, April 2000.

6. Kumar, p. 53.

7. *New York Times*, 2 November 1947. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation, 1947–48*, Delhi, 1994, pp. 60–61.

8. *The Times*, 1 November 1947.

9. Brigadier Hiralal Atal provided a detailed account of the evacuation, conducted 'without exposing the family to detection which would have brought [Sheikh Abdullah] into disrepute and gravely affected his leadership', in his book *Nehru's Emissary to Kashmir*, New Delhi, 1972, pp. 51–54. Nehru wrote from Delhi to Sheikh Abdullah in Srinagar on 31 October, mentioning in passing that 'Begum Abdullah and family are leaving by plane early tomorrow for Indore', *Selected Works*, 2:4, pp. 294–95.

10. *Times of India*, 9 October 1947.

11. Nehru to Hiralal Atal, *Selected Works*, 2:4. pp. 283–86.

12. *The Times*, 28, 29 and 31 October 1947. Sheikh Abdullah's own brief account of the recruitment and deployment of 'the People's Militia' is in his autobiography, *Flames of the Chinar*, New Delhi, 1993, pp. 93–94.

13. Kuldip Singh Bajwa, pp. 112–13.

14. *Hindustan Times*, 3 November 1947. *Statesman*, 8 November 1947.

15. National Army Museum, London, 1963–12–248–4. The letter is dated '6.10.47' but that's clearly an error—it was probably written on or around 6 November. Gwen Burton (otherwise Mrs Gwen Bird) wrote as a postscript: 'I am giving this to a Air Pilot to post in Delhi.' The Delhi postmark is dated 10 November 1947. I am grateful to her nephew, Gilbert Burton, for permission to quote from this letter.

16. Ajit Bhattacharjea, *Kashmir: The Wounded Valley*, Delhi, 1994, p. x.

17. Margaret Parton's papers, including letters to her mother written while in Kashmir, are at the Division of Special Collections, University of Oregon. Margaret Parton, *Journey through a Lighted Room*, New York, 1973, pp. 113–

14. See also her earlier book *The Leaf and the Flame*, New York, 1959.

18. *Hindustan Times*, 6 November 1947.

19. *Dawn*, 24 October 1947.

20. Sat Paul Sahni went on to be a key figure in the Kashmir press corps and later became the Director General of Information for Farooq Abdullah, Sheikh Abdullah's son and political heir.

21. *New York Herald Tribune*, 2 November 1947. Also *New York Times*, 2 November 1947. DO 142/494, report from British diplomat in Lahore on 28–29 October 1947.

22. Personal communication from Jim Michaels. He eventually got better access to Kashmir travelling from Rawalpindi in Pakistan, and met and interviewed leaders of the Azad Kashmir movement in Poonch.

23. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, Delhi, n.d., pp. 35–36.

24. Akbar Khan, pp. 39–40. *Dawn*, 31 October 1947. Although there appear to have been no major accidents at the overcrowded airstrip at Srinagar, more than twenty Indian servicemen were killed on 31 October when a Dakota crashed near the Banihal pass—Kumar, p. 50.

25. L.P. Sen, pp. 66–67. *Washington Post*, 3 November 1947. Personal communication from Max Desfor. Several of his photographs were published in *Sphere*, 15 November 1947.

26. *Statesman*, 5 November 1947.

27. L.P. Sen, p. 74.

28. *Dawn* datelined Karachi, 7 December 1947 and cited in the Indian government's *White Paper* of the following year. Khurshid Anwar had been injured on 10 November, apparently by a splinter from an Indian bomb. He was getting medical treatment in Karachi at the time of the *Dawn* interview. He died a few months later.

29. Harbakhsh Singh, *In the Line of Duty: A Soldier Remembers*, New Delhi, 2000, pp. 200–03.

30. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir*, pp. 38–39.

31. *Times of India*, 7 November 1947.

32. *New York Herald Tribune*, 7 November 1947.

33. L.P. Sen, pp. 98–99.

34. *Dawn*, 8 November 1947 and report datelined 7 December 1947.

35. Akbar Khan, pp. 47–55. M. Ibrahim Khan, *The Kashmir Saga*, Mirpur, 1990, p. 135. *History of the Azad Kashmir Regiment, Vol. 1*, pp. 206–07.

36. Agha Humayun Amin, 'The war of lost opportunities: Part 1'.

37. Parton, *The Leaf and the Flame*, p. 274.

Chapter 9: 'Ten Days of Terror'

1. Father Shanks diary on pages for 14–21 June.

2. Father Shanks's typescript account of the attack on Baramulla, f. 6.

3. *Jusqu'à La Mort*, Franciscan Missionaries of Mary, Paris, 1956, p. 113.

4. Shanks diary entry on pages for March 28–31.

5. Diary of Sir George Cunningham, 7 November 1947, MSS Eur.D 670/6, India Office Records, British Library. The extent to which Bates derived his account of Kaushalya from Smith's reports in the *Daily Express* is discussed in chapter 11.

6. 'Notes of a Statement made by Major J.E. Thomson [sic] . . .' 3 ff., DO142/494, British National Archives.

7. A copy of the text of Father Shanks's letter is in the India Office Records, LP&S/13/1850, f. 114. It was also cited in the *Statesman*, 18 November 1947.

8. Aslam Khan's father, Brigadier Rahmatullah Khan, was placed under arrest and eventually released by the Indian authorities as part of a prisoner exchange, as detailed in Victoria Schofield, *Kashmir in Conflict: India, Pakistan and the Unfinished War*, London, 2000, p. 64 and P.N. Sharma, *Inside Pak Occupied Kashmir*, Delhi, 1958, p. 111.

9. The inscription on the rear, in Veronica Shanks's hand, dated the photograph to 1946. It is more likely to have been taken at the time of the lashkar's incursion in the following year.

10. Rev. G. Shanks, 'Au Revoir, Baramulla!', *Missions and Missionaries*, London, Summer 1948, pp. 8–10.

11. My lengthy attempts to track down Sydney Smith ended when I chanced upon his obituary in the *Daily Telegraph*, 6 February 2002, from which details of his life and career are taken. Smith had lived for many years in France, where he died on 12 December 2001, aged eighty-nine.

12. DO142/494, British National Archives.

13. Ignacio Omaechevarria, *Una Victima Perfecta*, Vitoria, 1949, p. 161, suggests that Smith joined the other captives on 2 November, the seventh day of their ordeal, relying apparently on the account of Sister Priscilla.

14. *Selected Works*, 2: 4, New Delhi, 1986, p. 317.

15. *Daily Express*, 11 November 1947.

16. Father Shanks, typescript, f. 7.

17. Jahan Ara Shahnawaz, *Father and Daughter: A Political Autobiography*, Lahore, 1971, pp. 232–38. Begum Shahnawaz's account is unreliable, suggesting among other things that her daughter flew into Baramulla. Tazi Shahnawaz died in a plane crash in 1948 at the age of 35. There is a brief but affectionate pen portrait of her by the *Herald Tribune's* Margaret Parton, *Journey through a Lighted Room*, New York, 1973, p. 109.

18. LP&S/13/1850, f.159, India Office Records.

19. A copy of Lily Boal's letter, written at Haripur in the North West Frontier Province and dated 8 November, is in the India Office Records at LP&S/13/1850, ff.66–67. Accounts of Davies's mission and death are given in Jock Purves, *Lal Sahib: The Story of Ronald Davies, Missionary, Soldier, Martyr*, Stirling, 1950, and in Margaret Brown, *Cross Every Mountain: The Story of Lily Boal, Missionary to Kashmir, India and Pakistan*, Newtownabbey, 1992.

20. *Daily Express*, 10 November 1947. I am grateful to the *Daily Express* for permission to include extracts from the newspaper in this book.

21. *Daily Express*, 11 November 1947.

22. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation, 1947–48*, New Delhi, 1994, p. 103.

23. P.N. Sharma, p. 16.
24. *New York Herald Tribune*, 11 November 1947.
25. *The Times*, 11 November 1947.
26. Copyright by the New York Times Co. Reprinted with permission.
27. *Times of India*, 11 November 1947. Mahmud of Ghazni was an eleventh century Muslim ruler noted for the reputed violence of his incursions into India.
28. LP&S/13/1850, f.36, India Office Records.
29. LP&S/13/1850, ff. 20, 76.
30. *Hindustan Times*, 14 November 1947. *Times of India*, 13 November 1947.

Chapter 10: War

1. There is a brief account of the demonstration at which Lone was beaten up in Manoj Joshi's *The Lost Rebellion: Kashmir in the Nineties*, New Delhi, 1999, p. 261.
2. Abdul Ghani Lone was shot dead on 21 May 2002 at a memorial meeting in Srinagar for Mirwaiz Maulvi Farooq, also believed to have been killed by armed separatists. For accounts of Lone's killing and the way it was reported, see Arun Joshi, *Eyewitness Kashmir*, Singapore, 2004, pp. 236–8, and Muzamil Jaleel, 'Deciphering Silence in Kashmir', in B.G. Verghese (ed.), *Breaking the Big Story: Great Moments in Indian Journalism*, New Delhi, 2003. Obituaries stated that Lone had been born in 1932.
3. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation 1947–48*, New Delhi, 1994, pp. 80, 87.
4. *Times of India*, 10 November 1947.
5. Margaret Parton papers, Division of Special Collections, University of Oregon. This letter took the form of a travel journal, of which this section appears to have been written on 10 and 14 November 1947.
6. The *Times of India* and the *Statesman*, 15 November 1947, both quoted prisoners as alleging Pakistani government complicity in the raid. See also testimony included in Government of India *White Paper on Jammu & Kashmir*, 1948.
7. *Hindustan Times*, 20 November 1947. Similar remarks by Sheikh Abdullah were reported in the *Statesman*, 18 November 1947. In a robust piece of political rhetoric, Sheikh Abdullah also declared it a 'duty of every Mussalman to start a jihad (holy war) against these raiders who are spoiling the [fair] name of Islam'—*Statesman*, 27 November 1947.
8. *Times of India*, 11 November 1947.
9. *White Paper on Jammu & Kashmir*, p. 26. See also Sheikh Abdullah, *Flames of the Chinar*, New Delhi, 1993, p. 99.
10. *New York Times*, 16 November 1947. *Hindustan Times*, 21 November 1947.

11. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread*, pp. 113–14.
12. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir, (1947–48)*, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, 1987, pp. 71–76. The defence committee meetings referred were held on 28 November and 3 December 1947.
13. Harbakhsh Singh, *In the Line of Duty: A Soldier Remembers*, New Delhi, 2000, p. 207.
14. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, Delhi, p. 47. *Dawn*, 12 November 1947.
15. Article in *Dawn* datelined 7 December [1947] cited in the Indian government's *White Paper* of 1948.
16. DO142/494, British National Archives.
17. Akbar Khan, *Raiders in Kashmir*, pp. 90–91.
18. *Statesman*, 28 November 1947.
19. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread*, p. 143.
20. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir*, pp. 87–88. See also Sen, pp. 146–51 and Harbakhsh Singh, pp. 216–17.
21. For brief accounts of the Gilgit 'rebellion', see Victoria Schofield, *Kashmir in Conflict: India, Pakistan and the Unfinished War*, London, 2000, pp. 62–64, and Alistair Lamb, *Incomplete Partition*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, pp. 190–95. And for the account of the instigator, William A. Brown, *The Gilgit Rebellion 1947*, London, 1998.
22. Christopher Snedden, 'What Happened to Muslims in Jammu? Local Identity, "the Massacre" of 1947 and the Roots of the "Kashmir Problem"', *South Asia*, 2001, 24/2, pp. 111–34.
23. Parvez Dewan, *Jammu, Kashmir, Ladakh: Jammu*, New Delhi, 2007, pp. 116–60. Alexander Evans's forthcoming essay on communal violence in Jammu division in 1947 argues that over 300,000 people were displaced from Indian-administered and Pakistan-administered Kashmir, and that thousands of Hindus and Sikhs and tens of thousands of Muslims were killed.
24. *History of the Azad Kashmir Regiment, Vol. 1 (1947–49)*, Mansar, 1997, p. 27.
25. Autobiographical notes compiled by Russell Haight in 2005, and provided to me by his daughter, Alexandra Haight Furr. Haight—a veteran of both the Canadian and US armies who served in the Second World War and later in Korea and in Vietnam—died in Norman, Oklahoma, aged eighty-four in 2006.
26. *Rocky Mountain News*, undated cutting, probably November 1947. I am grateful to Alexandra Haight Furr for sending me copies of a compilation of newspaper cuttings relating to her father's time in Kashmir, and of the note from the Azad Kashmir government.
27. *Daily Express*, 25 November 1947.
28. *New York Times*, 29 January 1948. Copyright by The New York Times Co. Reprinted with permission.

29. Robert Trumbull, *As I See India*, New York, 1956, pp. 92–93.
30. Letter dated 8 January 1948, DO142/494, British National Archives.
31. Cunningham Diary, 7 November 1947.
32. Brian Cloughley, *A History of the Pakistan Army: Wars and Insurrections*, Oxford, 2000, pp. 18–21.
33. *White Paper on Jammu & Kashmir*, pp. 52–55. The text of Nehru's broadcast was also carried in the *Times of India*, 3 November 1947 and in other daily papers.
34. *Hindustan Times*, 12 November 1947. *Times of India*, 17 November 1947.
35. Alongside Nehru's public stance, in private correspondence he showed some willingness to be flexible on the Kashmir issue. In a somewhat overlooked letter to the maharaja on 1 December 1947, Nehru canvassed the options of a plebiscite, or independence or various partition lines and was reconciled to the possibility of areas such as Poonch being part of Pakistan. Ramachandra Guha, *India After Gandhi: The History of the World's Largest Democracy*, London, 2007, pp. 71–72.
- ³⁶The full text of the resolution is given in Josef Korbel, *Danger in Kashmir*, Princeton, 1966, pp. 357–62. The resolution's failure to consider any other option for Kashmir but accession to either India or Pakistan was a blow to any remaining aspirations for independence.
- ³⁷Korbel, pp. 97, 198, 207. Korbel's daughter, Madeleine Albright, was several decades later the US secretary of state.
38. The theme of Soviet ambitions in Kashmir formed the backdrop to a thriller set amid Srinagar and the ski slopes of Gulmarg, M.M. Kaye's *Death in Kashmir*. Mollie Kaye was born in India and knew Kashmir well.
39. Korbel, p. 121.
40. *History of Operations in Jammu and Kashmir*, p. 171 et seq.
41. Cited in R.J. Moore, *Making the New Commonwealth*, Oxford, 1987, p. 83.
42. Moore, p. 89. Alastair Lamb, *Incomplete Partition*, pp. 241–42, cites different figures, which show a less clear-cut but still significant imbalance in the role of British officers and troops in the Indian and Pakistani armed forces.
43. Lt Col. J.H. Harvey-Kelly's account of his mission to Kashmir was serialized in a regimental veterans' journal *Hagha Dagha* and republished in abridged form in the *Indian Army Association Newsletter* in April 1998. He named Major Johnnie Benskin of the Kurram Militia as another British officer who saw active service in Kashmir, and was later withdrawn on orders from above. The story of Harvey-Kelly's involvement in Kashmir also featured in his obituary in the *Daily Telegraph*, 17 October 1994.
44. Telegrams and letters dated 8 January, 16 January and 30 January 1948, DO142/494, British National Archives. Alastair Lamb suggests that one British officer died on service with Pakistan forces in Kashmir, and up to twelve

others were at times deployed there in 1948—*Incomplete Partition*, p. 242. See also Parvez Dewan, *Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh: Jammu*, New Delhi, 2007, p. 137.

45. Victoria Schofield, *Kashmir in Conflict*, p. 67.

Chapter 11: Telling Stories and Making Myths

1. Sir George Cunningham, Diary, 4 November 1947, MSS Eur.D.607/6, India Office Records, British Library. The second woman journalist was probably Lee Eitingon, a *Life* reporter who often worked in tandem with the photographer Bourke-White.

2. Margaret Bourke-White, *Portrait of Myself*, New York, 1963, p. 272. Bourke-White died in 1971 at the age of sixty-seven.

3. Vicki Goldberg, *Margaret Bourke-White: A Biography*, London, 1987, p. 311. Several of Bourke-White's most memorable photographs of Partition were republished in 2006 in a special edition of one of the most famous of Partition novels, Khushwant Singh's *Train to Pakistan*.

4. Margaret Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom: A Report on the New India*, New York, 1949, p. xi.

5. Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom*, p. 206.

6. Despatch from Peshawar to Karachi, 27 November [1947], DO 142/494, British National Archives.

7. Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom*, pp. 207–08.

8. B.P.L. 'Baba' Bedi was a communist and close adviser to Sheikh Abdullah, who later moved away from political activism to pursue spiritual concerns. He died in 1993 aged eighty-three. His British wife, Freda, who also lived for several years in Kashmir, turned from left-wing politics to become a renowned practitioner of Tibetan Buddhism.

9. Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom*, p. 211. These reminiscences, while richly illustrated, contain no photographs from Baramulla or Abbottabad. Bourke-White's photos and negatives, as well as some personal papers, are held at Syracuse University Library in New York, which advises that none are labelled in a manner to suggest they were taken in Kashmir.

10. Bourke-White, *Halfway to Freedom*, pp. 210–11. 'Mujahid' means 'holy warrior', and in more recent years has come to denote an Islamic radical pursuing jihad in Afghanistan, Kashmir or elsewhere.

11. Muhammad Yusuf Saraf, *Kashmiris Fight for Freedom*, Vol. 2, Lahore, 1979, pp. 942–43. The incident during Jinnah's 1944 visit is recounted in Saraf, Vol. 1, p. 633 and Parvez Dewan, *Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh: Kashmir*, New Delhi, 2004, p. 86.

12. *Times of India*, *Statesman*, *Hindustan Times*, 11 November 1947.

13. I am grateful to P.N. Jalali for making available to me cuttings from the *People's Age* apparently from issues of November and December 1947.

14. *Statesman*, 22 November 1947.

15. Sheikh Abdullah, *Flames of the Chinar*, New Delhi, 1993, p. 96. L.P. Sen, *Slender Was the Thread: Kashmir Confrontation, 1947–48*, New Delhi, 1994, p. 141. *Kashmir Defends Democracy*, New Delhi, 1948, p. 10. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir (1947–48)*, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi, 1987, p. 23. Parvez Dewan, *Parvez Dewan's Jammu, Kashmir and Ladakh: Kashmir*, New Delhi, 2004, p. 94.
16. Saros Cowasjee, *So Many Freedoms: A Study of the Major Fiction of Mulk Raj Anand*, Delhi, 1977, pp. 163–65.
17. V.K. Krishna Menon's *Marathon Speech on Kashmir at the U.N. Security Council*, Allahabad, 1992, p. 26.
18. From the section entitled 'Mujahid Sherwani' in Somnath Dhar's 'Tales of Kashmir', www.ikashmir.org/sndhar/9.html
19. *History of Operations in Jammu & Kashmir*, p. 31. Rai was posthumously awarded the Maha Vir Chakra, a decoration for military gallantry.
20. *I Will Be the First: The Story of Mother Mary Teresalina*, London, 1957, p. 29. In a later reprint, the dying words have been edited, rather clumsily, to suggest that the nun offered herself for the 'people' not the 'conversion' of Kashmir.
21. Father Ignacio Omaechevarria, *Una Victima Perfecta*, Vitoria, 1949, p. 142. *Jusqu'à la Mort*, Rome, 1956, p. 130.
22. H. Nirmalraj [Father Hormise Nirmal Raj], 'Unknown Churches, Unknown Martyrs', an undated 103ff. typescript in the Mill Hill archive. Spelling and grammar has been slightly amended. This study was written in 1976. I am grateful to the Mill Hill archivist, Father Hans Boerakker, for his kindness in making available to me a copy of the typescript and putting me in touch with Father Nirmal Raj.
23. There are better attested accounts of Hindu and Sikh women drowning themselves in Muzaffarabad, notably in Krishna Mehta, *Kashmir 1947: A Survivor's Story*, New Delhi, 2005, a new edition of a book first published in the 1950s.
24. The Thoa Khalsa deaths feature in Bhisham Sahni's novel *Tamas* and the incident is explored and recounted in Urvashi Butalia, *The Other Side of Silence: Voices from the Partition of India*, New Delhi, 1998, pp. 193–245.
25. *Daily Express*, 10 November 1947.
26. George Shanks to Very Rev. T. McLaughlin, 23 November 1947, Mill Hill archive.
27. The telegram is date-stamped 31 August 1948. I am grateful to Sydney Smith's daughter, Peta Adès, for lending me some of her father's cuttings books and much other help. She is unaware of the location of any diary kept by her father during this period.
28. Undated letter from Anthony Havelock-Allan at Constellation Films to the Very Rev. Thomas McLaughlin, who acknowledged receipt on 21 April 1949. The letter, along with several other documents relating to the Mill Hill missionaries in Kashmir, is in the 'Pakistan' files in the Mill Hill archive.

29. H.E. Bates, *The Scarlet Sword*, pp. 13–15. Page references are to the edition published by Cassell Military Paperbacks in 2001. The argument about Bates's literary borrowing from Sydney Smith was made in my review article, 'Bates and Baramulla', published in *Biblio*, New Delhi, November/December 2001, pp. 17–18. Father Shanks's account of Kaushalya has been discussed in Chapter 9.

30. Bates, *Scarlet Sword*, p. 157.

31. Dean R. Baldwin, *H.E. Bates: A Literary Life*, Selinsgrove, 1987, p. 169. I am grateful to Professor Baldwin for his readily offered insights into Bates's literary method, and his guidance on contemporary reviews of *The Scarlet Sword*. The review cited appeared in the *Saturday Review of Literature*, 27 January 1951.

32. Bates, *Scarlet Sword*, p. 52.

33. Alan Moorehead, *The Rage of the Vulture*, London, 1948, p. 136. Almost sixty years later, events in Kashmir in 1947 featured prominently in Salman Rushdie's Kashmir novel *Shalimar the Clown*.

34. Ian Stephens, *Horned Moon: An Account of a Journey through Pakistan, Kashmir, and Afghanistan*, London, 1953, p. 109. The quotes were from a contemporary memorandum written by Stephens.

35. Stephens, *Horned Moon*, p. 202. Azad, or 'Free', Kashmir refers to that part under Pakistan's control.

36. Stephens, *Horned Moon*, p. 218.

37. Ian Stephens, *Pakistan*, New York, 1963, pp. 193–203.

38. L.F. Rushbrook Williams, *The State of Pakistan*, London, 1962, p. 78.

39. Alastair Lamb, *Incomplete Partition: The Genesis of the Kashmir Dispute, 1947–1948*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, p. 187.

40. Hasan Zaheer, *The Times and Trial of the Rawalpindi Conspiracy 1951: The First Coup Attempt in Pakistan*, Karachi, 1998, p. 145.

41. *Times of India*, 13 April 1957.

42. 'Sack of Baramulla Recalled: Story Told by Foreign Survivors', *Kashmir*, November 1958, pp. 273 et seq. I am grateful to Khurshid Guru for e-mailing me a copy of this article.

43. *New York Times*, 11 November 1947.

44. V.P. Menon, *Integration of the Indian States*, Hyderabad, 1985, p. 406. Other examples of misleading citing of Trumbull's figures include Sisir Gupta, *Kashmir: A Study in India-Pakistan Relations*, Mumbai, 1966, p. 111; Jyoti Bhusan Das Gupta, *Jammu and Kashmir*, The Hague, 1968, p. 96; Amarinder Singh, *Lest We Forget*, Patiala, 2000, p. 19.

45. Sheikh Mohammed Abdullah, *Jammu and Kashmir Constituent Assembly: Opening Address*, 1951, p. 17.

Chapter 12: 'I Think They'll Try Again'

1. The downfall of Sheikh Abdullah and the breach between Srinagar and Delhi is told briefly but effectively in Sumantra Bose, *Kashmir: Roots of Conflict, Paths to Peace*, London, 2003.

2. The issue of what was said at Shimla is discussed, with varying conclusions, in Alastair Lamb, *Incomplete Partition: The Genesis of the Kashmir Dispute, 1947–1948*, Hertingfordbury, 1997, pp. 295–96; Victoria Schofield, *Kashmir in Conflict: India, Pakistan and the Unfinished War*, London, 2000, pp. 16–121; Sumit Ganguly, *The Crisis in Kashmir: Portents of War, Hopes of Peace*, Cambridge, 1997, pp. 59–63; and Owen Bennett Jones, *Pakistan: Eye of the Storm*, Yale, 2002, pp. 80–81.

3. One senior Indian army officer commented of Kargil: ‘What has happened seems similar to what Pakistan did in 1947 and 1965 when it used the façade of Mujaheddins and Kabailis’—cited in Praveen Swami, *The Kargil War*, New Delhi, 2005, p. 27.

4. The most significant writings by Kashmiri Muslims about the conflict and its antecedents are in large part autobiographical, notably Sheikh Mohammad Abdullah, *Flames of the Chinar*, Delhi, 1993, and Muhammad Yusuf Saraf, *Kashmiris Fight for Freedom*, 2 Vols, Lahore, 1977 and 1979.

5. Saraf, Vol. 2, p. 903.